RESISTING CATEGORIES: LATIN AMERICAN AND/OR LATINO?

ORGANIZED BY
HÉCTOR OLEA
MARI CARMEN RAMÍREZ
TOMÁS YBARRA-FRAUSTO

with Document Introductions by
MARÍA C. GAZTAMBIDE

EDITED BY
HÉCTOR OLEA
MELINA KERVANDJIAN

THE MUSEUM OF FINE ARTS, HOUSTON
INTERNATIONAL CENTER FOR THE ARTS OF THE AMERICAS
Distributed by YALE UNIVERSITY PRESS, NEW HAVEN and LONDON
© 2012 by The Museum of Fine Arts, Houston. All rights reserved.

This book may not be reproduced, in whole or in part, including illustrations, in any form (beyond that copying permitted by Sections 107 and 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law and except by reviewers for the public press), without written permission from the publisher.


PUBLICATIONS DIRECTOR: Diane Lovejoy
EDITORIAL MANAGER: Melina Kervandjian

COVER AND BOOK DESIGN: HvA Design, New York
Henk van Assen with Loide Marwanga

INDEX: J. Naomi Linzer Indexing Services

Printed in the United States of America by Capital Offset Company, Inc.

Distributed by Yale University Press
New Haven and London
www.yalebooks.com/art

Cover illustration and frontispiece: Rafael Alberti, letter (detail) to León Ferrari, Rome, Italy, April 1965. Personal archive of León Ferrari, Buenos Aires, Argentina. [SEE DIGITAL ARCHIVE 743697]

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
Resisting categories: Latin American and/or Latino / organized by Héctor Olea, Mari Carmen Ramírez, Tomás Ybarra-Frausto; with document introductions by María C. Gaztambide; edited by Héctor Olea and Melina Kervandjian.

pages cm

—(Critical documents of 20th-century Latin American and Latino art ; v. 1)

Summary: "This anthology of more than 165 seminal writings by influential twentieth- and twenty-first-century artists and critics who explore and challenge complex definitions of what it means to be 'Latin American' or 'Latino' is designed to be an indispensable tool for the study of Latin American and Latino art" —Provided by publisher.
Includes bibliographical references and index.


1. Art, Latin American. 2. Hispanic American art.
I. Ramírez, Mari Carmen, 1955- editor of compilation.
II. Ybarra-Frausto, Tomás, 1938- editor of compilation.
III. Olea, Héctor, editor of compilation.
IV. Gaztambide, María C., writer of added commentary.
V. Kervandjian, Melina, editor.

N6502.R47 2012
704.03'68—DC23 2011053252
VOLUME 01
RESISTING CATEGORIES: LATIN AMERICAN AND/OR LATINO?

FOREWORD
BY GWENDOLYN H. GOFFE | 20

FUNDERS OF THE ICAA DIGITAL ARCHIVE AND BOOK SERIES | 23

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS | 24

CRITICAL DOCUMENTS OF 20TH-CENTURY LATIN AMERICAN AND LATINO ART
A DIGITAL ARCHIVE AND PUBLICATIONS PROJECT
BY MARI CARMEN RAMÍREZ | 27

PROJECT ADMINISTRATION, STAFF, AND CONSULTANTS | 33

A BRIEF GUIDE TO USING VOLUME I
NOTES ON THE SELECTION, PRESENTATION, EDITING, AND ANNOTATION OF TEXTS | 36

RESISTING CATEGORIES
BY HÉCTOR OLEA, MARI CARMEN RAMÍREZ, AND TOMÁS YBARRA-FRAUSTO | 40

CHAPTER 1 THE CONTINENTAL UTOPIA
INTRODUCTION BY HÉCTOR OLEA | 50

I.1. America as a Utopian Refraction

I.1.1 Concerning the Islands Recently Discovered in the Indian Sea
Christopher Columbus, 1493 | 62
IV.4.5  Etsedrón: Comments on the Article by Aracy A. Amaral
Juan Acha, 1976  |  759

IV.4.6  Etsedrón, or the Lack of Libidinous Interest in Reality
Maria Luisa Torrens, 1976  |  763

IV.4.7  The Necessary Plurality of Latin American Art
Manuel Felguérez, 1976  |  767

IV.4.8 – IV.4.9
CONTROVERSIES AND PAPERS: SYMPOSIUM OF THE FIRST LATIN AMERICAN BIENNIAL
OF SÃO PAULO

IV.4.8  First Latin American Biennial of São Paulo
Frederico de Morais, 1979  |  769

IV.4.9  Why Do We Fear Latin Americanism?
Aracy A. Amaral, 1978  |  774

IV.4.10 – IV.4.11
A FIRST CRITICAL ENCOUNTER WITH ARTISTS AND THE VISUAL ARTS: AN INTERNATIONAL
COLLOQUIUM, MUSEO DE BELLAS ARTES DE CARACAS, JUNE 1978

IV.4.10  Alternatives for Current Latin American Painting
Carlos Rodriguez Saavedra, 1978  |  777

IV.4.11  Questions
Julio Le Parc, 1978  |  783

CHAPTER V  DESTABILIZING CATEGORIZATIONS
INTRODUCTION BY TOMÁS YBARRA-FRAUSTO  |  790

V.1.  Exhibiting Entrenched Representations

V.1.1 – V.1.2
HISPANIC AMERICAN ART IN CHICAGO, AN EXHIBITION AT THE CHICAGO STATE UNIVERSITY
ART GALLERY

V.1.1  Hispanic-American Art in Chicago
Robert L. Weitz, 1980  |  802

V.1.2  Some Thoughts Concerning the Exhibit of Hispanic Art in Chicago
Victor A. Sorell, 1980  |  804

V.1.3 – V.1.7
HISPANIC ART IN THE UNITED STATES: THIRTY CONTEMPORARY PAINTERS AND SCULPTORS,
MUSEUM OF FINE ARTS, HOUSTON, MAY–SEPTEMBER 1987

V.1.3  Hispanic Art in the United States
John Beardsley and Jane Livingston, 1987  |  809
### 1.2.9 Does Latin America Exist?
- **Darcy Ribeiro**, 1976 | 155

### 1.2.10 The Invention of an Operative Concept: The Latin-ness of America
- **Guy Martinière**, 1978 | 164

### 1.2.11 Latin America: An Introduction to Far-Western Identity
- **Alain Rouquié**, 1987 | 178

### 1.3. Nuestra América, the Multi-Homeland

#### 1.3.1 Letter from Lope de Aguirre, Rebel, to King Philip of Spain
- **Lope de Aguirre**, 1561 | 189

#### 1.3.2 Reply of a South American to a Gentleman of this Island (Jamaica)
- **Simón Bolívar**, 1815 | 193

#### 1.3.3 The Latin American Multi-Homeland
- **José María Torres Caicedo**, 1864–65 | 200

#### 1.3.4 Our America
- **José Martí**, 1891 | 208

#### 1.3.5 Latin America—Evils of Origin (Summary)
- **Manoel de Bomfim**, 1905 | 215

#### 1.3.6 Latin American Perspectives
- **José Veríssimo**, 1912 | 222

#### 1.3.7 The Creation of a Continent
- **Francisco García Calderón**, 1912 | 226

#### 1.3.8 Letter to the Youth of Colombia
- **José Vasconcelos**, 1923 | 231

#### 1.3.9 The Beginnings of an American Culture
- **Albert Zum Felde**, 1924 | 236

### 1.4. Is América a No-Place?

#### 1.4.1 Latin America—Evils of Origin (Conclusion)
- **Manoel de Bomfim**, 1905 | 241

#### 1.4.2 Indology
- **José Vasconcelos**, 1926 | 245

#### 1.4.3 First Message to Hispanic America
- **Waldo Frank**, 1930 | 255

#### 1.4.4 Guardians of the Quill
- **Alfonso Reyes**, 1930 | 259

#### 1.4.5 The Destiny of America
- **Alfonso Reyes**, 1942 | 261
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1.2</td>
<td>Utopia</td>
<td>Thomas More, 1516</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.3</td>
<td>New Atlantis</td>
<td>Sir Francis Bacon, 1623</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.4</td>
<td>Machu Picchu: The Discovery</td>
<td>Hiram Bingham, 1911</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.5</td>
<td>The Christening of America</td>
<td>Alfonso Reyes, 1942</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.6</td>
<td>The March of Utopias</td>
<td>Oswald de Andrade, 1953</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.7</td>
<td>The Invention of America</td>
<td>Edmundo O’Gorman, 1961</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 1.2. The Invention of an Operative Concept

### 1.2.1 The Latin American States | 105
- Letter to His Majesty the Emperor Napoleon III
  - Charles (Carlos) Calvo, 1862
- Letter from M. Thouvenel, Minister Of The French Foreign Office,
  to Charles (Carlos) Calvo
  - Édouard Thouvenel, 1862
- Latin America
  - Charles (Carlos) Calvo, 1862

### 1.2.2 Ancient and Modern Mexico
- Michel Chevalier, 1863 | 111

### 1.2.3 The Latin Democracies in America | 118
- Preface to Francisco García Calderón’s *The Latin Democracies in America*
  - Raymond Poincaré, 1912
- *The Latin Democracies in America*
  - Francisco García Calderón, 1912

### 1.2.4 To what extent is there a Latin America?
- André Siegfried, 1934 | 126

### 1.2.5 Latin America
- Mário de Andrade, 1934 | 128

### 1.2.6 Does Latin America Exist?
- Luis Alberto Sánchez, 1945 | 132

### 1.2.7 Luis Alberto Sánchez’s Book: Is There Just One Latin America?
- Fernand Braudel, 1948 | 142

### 1.2.8 Latin American Unity
- Jean Casimir, 1969 | 149
CHAPTER II  A NEW ART
INTRODUCTION BY MARI CARMEN RAMÍREZ  | 338

II.1.  A New Art for a New Continent

II.1.1  A Visit to the Exhibition at [The School] of Fine Arts
José Martí, 1875  | 346

II.1.2  Three Appeals for the Current Guidance of the New Generation of American Painters and Sculptors
David Alfaro Siqueiros, 1921  | 348

II.1.3  Eurindia
Ricardo Rojas, 1924  | 352

II.1.4  Art Interpretations
Carlos Mérida, 1926  | 362

II.1.5  The New Art
Martí Casanovas, 1927  | 364

II.1.6  New World, New Races, New Art
José Clemente Orozco, 1926  | 366

II.1.7  Lesson 132: The American Man and the Art of the Americas
Joaquín Torres-García, 1941  | 367

II.2.  Surveys Concerning a Continental Attitude

II.2.1 – II.2.7
A SURVEY: WHAT SHOULD AMERICAN ART BE? (1928–29)

II.2.1  Response to revista de avance Survey
Jaime Torres Bodet, 1928  | 373

II.2.2  Response to revista de avance Survey
Eduardo Abela, 1928  | 377

II.2.3  Response to revista de avance Survey
Carlos Enríquez, 1929  | 379

II.2.4  Response to revista de avance Survey
Eduardo Avilés Ramírez, 1929  | 380

II.2.5  Response to revista de avance Survey
José Antonio Ramos, 1929  | 382

II.2.6  Response to revista de avance Survey
Raúl Roa, 1929  | 384

II.2.7  State of an Investigation
Francisco Ichaso, 1929  | 386
II.2.8  Apex of the New Taste
Jorge Mañach, 1929  |  390
II.2.9  Our Surveys: Painting in Latin America, What Luis Felipe Noé has to Say
Luis Felipe Noé, 1961  |  396

II.3.  Harbingers of the New Art

II.3.1 – II.3.2
XUL SOLAR ON PETTORUTI
II.3.1  Pettoruti and His Works
Xul Solar, 1923  |  402
II.3.2  Pettoruti
Xul Solar, c. 1923–24  |  404

II.3.3 – II.3.4
ON CARLOS MÉRIDA
II.3.3  Images of Guatemala
André Salmon, 1927  |  406
II.3.4  Carlos Mérida: Essay on the Art of the Tropics
Luis Cardoza y Aragón, 1928  |  409
II.3.5  Pablo Picasso: First Spiritual Unifier of Latin America
Germán Quiroga Galdo, 1935  |  414
II.3.6  Modern Mexican Painting
José Sabogal, 1937  |  417
II.3.7  Sabogal in Mexico
Mada Ontañón, 1942  |  419

CHAPTER III  THE GOOD NEIGHBORHOOD AND BAD TIMES
INTRODUCTION BY TOMÁS YBARRA-FRAUSTO  |  424

III.1.  The Monroe Doctrine: A Precursor to Pan Americanism

III.1.1  Annual Message: The Monroe Doctrine
James Monroe, 1823  |  438
III.1.2  The American Illusion
Eduardo Prado, 1894  |  441
1.4.6 The Actual Function of Philosophy in Latin America
Leopoldo Zea, 1942 | 266

1.5. Tensions at Stake

1.5.1 Latin America
Charles Malato, 1902 | 275

1.5.2 Toward an Efficient Latin America
Pedro Figari, 1925 | 277

1.5.3 Barren Imperialism
Pablo Rojas Paz, 1927 | 283

1.5.4 – 1.5.6
CONTROVERSY ON THE OPPOSITE POLES OF OUR CULTURE
1.5.4 Which Culture Will Create Latin America: The Mexican Parameter or the Argentinean One?
Antenor Orrego, 1928 | 286

1.5.5 Autochtonism and Europeanism
Marti Casanovas, 1928 | 289

1.5.6 Americanism and Peruvianism
Antenor Orrego, 1928 | 293

1.5.7 The Anthropophagous Manifesto
Oswald de Andrade, 1928 | 297

1.6. Does Brazil Belong to Latin America?

1.6.1 Brazil in the Americas
Manoel Bomfim, 1929 | 301

1.6.2 The Disconnection of America
Prudente de Moraes Neto, 1932 | 307

1.6.3 The Cordial Man, an American Product
Ribeiro Couto, 1932 | 309

1.6.4 The Roots of Brazil: Frontiers of Europe
Sérgio Buarque de Holanda, 1936 | 311

1.6.5 The Roots of Brazil: The Sower and the Bricklayer
Sérgio Buarque de Holanda, 1936 | 318

1.6.6 What Does Latin America Mean?
Afrânio Coutinho, 1969 | 324

1.6.7 Brazilians and Our America
Antonio Candido, 1993 | 327
III.1.3 The Ailing Continent

César Zumeta, 1899 | 449

III.1.4 Europe and Latin America: Current Opinion and Consequences of European Malevolence

Manoel Bomfim, 1905 | 452

III.1.5 Landings: Culture and Hispano-Americanism

Samuel Gili Gaya, 1930 | 457

III.1.6 Bolívar-ism and Monroe-ism: Hispanic-Americanism and Pan Americanism

José Vasconcelos, 1934 | 459

III.1.7 The Latin American Essays: Newton Freitas

Mário de Andrade, 1944 | 468

III.1.8 The Puerto Rican Personality in the Commonwealth

Luis Muñoz Marín, 1953 | 472

III.2. The Half-Worlds in Conflict

III.2.1 Ariel: The Idea of Nordomania

José Enrique Rodó, 1900 | 479

III.2.2 The American Half-Worlds

Waldo Frank, 1931 | 483

III.2.3 Americanism and Hispanicism

Gilberto Freyre, 1942 | 494

III.2.4 Edward Weston and Tina Modotti

Diego Rivera, 1926 | 497

III.2.5 Art and Pan Americanism

Diego Rivera, 1943 | 499

III.2.6 Latin American Unity: A Battle Of Diplomacy in San Francisco

Octavio Paz, 1945 | 503

III.2.7 Caliban: A Question

Roberto Fernández Retamar, 1969 | 509

III.3. An Insight from Latin America on U.S. Art and Society

III.3.1 Art in the United States

José Martí, 1888 | 514

III.3.2 Comrades in Chicago

Carlos Mérida, 1938 | 519
### III.3.3 My Opinion on the North American Artists’ Exhibition
**Joaquín Torres-García, 1941** | 523

### III.3.4 Impressions from My Visit to the United States of North America
**José Sabogal, 1943** | 531

### III.3.5 Letter from New York
**Damián Carlos Bayón, 1955** | 535

#### III.4. The U.S. “Presents” and “Collects” Latin American Art

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>III.4.1 - III.4.2</th>
<th>CONFERENCE ON INTER-AMERICAN RELATIONS IN THE FIELD OF ART</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>III.4.1</td>
<td>Conference On Inter-American Relations in the Field Of Art, Department Of State, Washington, D.C., October 11–12, 1939</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III.4.2</td>
<td>The Continuation Committee of the Conference on Inter-American Relations in the Field Of Art, February 15–16, 1940</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>III.4.3 - III.4.5</th>
<th>LATIN AMERICAN EXHIBITION OF FINE ARTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| III.4.3            | Message to the Latin American Exhibition of Fine Arts  
**Franklin Delano Roosevelt, 1940** | 554 |
| III.4.4            | Introduction to Latin American Exhibition of Fine Arts  
**Henry A. Wallace, 1940** | 556 |
| III.4.5            | Foreword to Latin American Exhibition of Fine Arts  
**Leo Stanton Rowe, 1940** | 556 |

| III.4.6            | The Latin American Collection of the Museum of Modern Art  
**Alfred H. Barr Jr., 1943** | 558 |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>III.4.7 - III.4.8</th>
<th>PROCEEDINGS OF A CONFERENCE HELD AT THE MUSEUM OF MODERN ART, MAY 29–31, 1945</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| III.4.7            | Problems of Research and Documentation in Contemporary Latin American Art  
**Alfred H. Barr Jr., 1945** | 562 |
| III.4.8            | Contemporary Regional Schools in Latin America  
**Grace L. McCann Morley, 1945** | 568 |

| III.4.9            | Traveling Exhibitions of Latin American Art Available for Circulation in the United States  
**National Gallery of Art, 1946** | 574 |
| III.4.10           | The United States Collects Pan American Art  
**Joseph Randall Shapiro, 1959** | 580 |
# CHAPTER IV  LONGING AND BELONGING

**INTRODUCTION BY MARI CARMEN RAMÍREZ** | 586

### IV.1. Straddling a Cultural Doctrine

**IV.1.1**  Introduction: “La Plebe”  
*Luis Valdez,* 1972  | 600

**IV.1.2**  The Cosmic Race: Grounds for a New Civilization  
*José Vasconcelos,* 1925  | 614

**IV.1.3**  The Historical and Intellectual Presence of Mexican-Americans  
*Octavio Ignacio Romano,* 1969  | 621

**IV.1.4**  Chicano Art  
*Shifra M. Goldman,* 1974  | 634

### IV.2. A Dose of Skepticism

**IV.2.1 – IV.2.2**  
*MARTA TRABA*

**IV.2.1**  What Does “A Latin American Art” Mean?  
*Marta Traba,* 1956  | 638

**IV.2.2**  Art’s Problems in Latin America  
*Marta Traba,* 1956  | 644

**IV.2.3**  The Emergent Decade: Latin American Painters and Painting in the 1960s  
*Thomas M. Messer,* 1966  | 652

**IV.2.4**  Art of Latin America Since Independence  
*Stanton L. Catlin and Terence Grieder,* 1966  | 656

**IV.2.5 – IV.2.6**  
**“THE QUESTION” CONCERNING LATIN AMERICAN ART**

**IV.2.5**  The Question of Latin American Art: Does It Exist?  
*Jacqueline Barnitz,* 1966–67  | 662

**IV.2.6**  “The Question” 17 Years Later  
*Jacqueline Barnitz,* 1984  | 667

**IV.2.7 – IV.2.8**  
**ARTES VISUALES ASKS THE QUESTION: “WHEN WILL THE ART OF LATIN AMERICA BECOME LATIN AMERICAN ART?”**

**IV.2.7**  In Reply to A Question: “When will the art of Latin America become Latin American art?”  
*Damián Carlos Bayón,* 1976  | 674
### IV.3. Our Janus-Faced Dilemma: Identity or Modernity?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subsection</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>IV.3.1 The Problem of the “Existence” of the Latin American Artist</td>
<td>Marta Traba</td>
<td>1956</td>
<td>688</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.3.2 Identity or Modernity?</td>
<td>Jorge Alberto Manrique</td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>692</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.3.3 The Invention of Latin American Art</td>
<td>Jorge Alberto Manrique</td>
<td>1978</td>
<td>701</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.3.4 The Visual Arts in a Consumer Society</td>
<td>Marta Traba</td>
<td>1972</td>
<td>705</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.3.5 Toward a New Artistic Problem in Latin America</td>
<td>Juan Acha</td>
<td>1973</td>
<td>714</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.3.6 The Specificity of Latin American Art</td>
<td>Saúl Yurkievich</td>
<td>1974</td>
<td>719</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.3.7 The Nostalgia for History in the Visual Imagination of Latin America</td>
<td>Luis Felipe Noé</td>
<td>1982</td>
<td>725</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.3.8 Modern Art in Latin America</td>
<td>Damián Bayón</td>
<td>1984</td>
<td>731</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### IV.4. Debating Identity on a Continental Scale

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subsection</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>IV.4.1 - IV.4.3</td>
<td>SPEAK OUT! CHARLÀ! BATE-PAPO!: CONTEMPORARY ART AND LITERATURE IN LATIN AMERICA,</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A SYMPOSIUM AT THE UNIVERSITY OF TEXAS AT AUSTIN, OCTOBER 1975</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.4.1</td>
<td>Latin American Art Today Does and Does Not Exist as a Distinct Expression</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Juan Acha, 1975</td>
<td>740</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.4.2</td>
<td>Latin America: A Culturally Occupied Continent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Aracy A. Amaral, 1975</td>
<td>744</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.4.3</td>
<td>We Are Latin Americans: The Way of Resistance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Marta Traba, 1975</td>
<td>749</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.4.4 - IV.4.7</td>
<td>THE ETSÈDRÔN DEBATE: THE 13TH SÃO PAULO BIENNIAL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.4.4</td>
<td>Etsèdrôn: A Form of Violence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Aracy A. Amaral, 1976</td>
<td>753</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
VI.2.6  Empowering the Local
  *Gustavo Buntinx*, 2005 | 1117

VI.2.7  From Latin American Art to Art from Latin America
  *Gerardo Mosquera*, 2003 | 1123

Editors’ Biographies | 1134
Researcher and Translator Credits | 1136
Index | 1140
Copyright Credits | 1157